Mr. C. Barton Wright.—About the general discussion on the budget.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Is it a point of order?

Mr. C. Barton Wright.—No.

President.—Then I cannot allow you to speak.

Voting of Demands for Grants (*contd.*)

Demand No. XXI—Medical—Rs. 2,47, 176 (*contd.*)

Motion No. 2 (*contd.*)

Mr. A. B. Salem.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 1,00,000 for "cost of medicines, instruments," by Rs. 25,000.*

President.—We were considering Motions 2 and 11 under Medical yesterday. We will continue it. Any other Member wishing to speak?

Mr. C.A. Kunjunni Raja.—I rise to support this motion. The Hon'ble Member for Narakkal has definitely stated that his conclusion is that the Departmental Head is the best person to decide from whom and from where and at what price medicine should be purchased for the State hospitals and that it is unsafe to appoint a committee for the purchase of medicine. On the face of it, this proposition is baseless and cannot stand scrutiny, because, if we apply these principles to other Departments, the absurdity becomes self-evident. Why should in the P.W. D. any tender be invited for works, if the works could be given to anybody whom the Chief Engineer may choose on whatever rates the Chief Engineer may like. So also in the Excise Department, if shops could be given at whatever rentals the Superintendent may choose and to whomsoever he likes, there will be a fall of the revenue. The Government was not inviting tenders for salt and this Council wanted open tenders to be invited and during the last year we find there is a considerable reduction in the rate of salt.

Mr. V. B. Vaidyanatha Ayyar.—The Excise Department was inviting tenders even before the Legislative Council came into existence.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—Even with tenders, you were managing to give the work to the same contractor Mr. Chettiar for a long period before this Council. Anyhow there are several other Departments where this principle, enunciated by the Member for Narakkal, cannot be applied usefully. For instance, why should you not authorise the Conservator of Forests to sell timber at whatever price he likes and to whomsoever he chooses? why not authorise the Diwan Peishkar to assign lands to whomsoever he likes on rates he may choose? I submit this is a proposition which cannot be accepted. Moreover, there is another difficulty. Here the person who purchases and who distributes the medicine is one and the same individual. In

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

British India the agencies for purchase and distribution are different. The Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer is not likely to attend to the various details of the medicines supplied and nobody can be sure if all the quantities are really purchased by the staff. I, therefore, heartily support the motion.

Mr. V. V. Anantapadmanabha Ayyar.—I also wish to say a few words in this connection.

President.—In support of the motion?

Mr. V. V. Anantapadmanabha Ayyar.—Yes. The charge brought forward by the Member for Trichur is that the cost of medicine which is purchased now is very much higher than the ordinary rate obtaining in the market. Now some of the Hon'ble Members were saying that we could purchase medicine more cheaply locally in India than if we get it from England directly. Because, they said, there were commission agents, and we can easily purchase from these commission agents at cheaper rates than if we were to purchase from the manufacturer himself. But Dadha and Company is not a commission agent. I understand that they are purchasing medicines from several places, and they are selling them at a profit here. I have definite information on that point. Further, when chemicals are purchased either for the use of the local college or for other colleges and schools directly from England, they are able to get it at much cheaper rates than if they were to purchase locally. We also find that, in the Indian Institute of Science, they are getting down chemicals directly from England with much profit.

Mr. C. Barton Wright.—Are all medicines got from Dadha and Co.?

Mr. V. V. Anantapadmanabha Ayyar.—In the case of chemicals as well as medicines, it may be that for some you have to order to Germany and others to England. Well, that has to be done, and it has to be got from the best sources, because we have not got commission agents in India so far as chemicals and medicines are concerned. But, whatever that might be, I do not think that there would be any objection for inviting tenders for the supply of medicines as is generally the case in every other Department. We may try if it could be got more cheaply. We can get quotations from foreign firms, and we can invite local tenders, and if anybody is prepared to supply at cheaper rates, there is no reason why we should not adopt that course. In this connection, it may be said that the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer must be given a wide discretion in the matter, and there should be absolute trust and mutual confidence between him and the people. He being a responsible Government servant, all of us should be prepared to grant that. But if there

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

is any mistake in the principle involved, or if there is any error of judgment, I believe we can point it out to the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer or the Government and proper action taken in the matter. In this connection I have to point out another matter also, that is, in connection with the scant support given by the Government with respect to the indigenous system of medicine in the State. (*Hear, hear.*) Well, we need not spend so much on medicines if we were to encourage the indigenous system of medicine. So far as surgery and other things are concerned, I do not dispute that the Allopathic system has a very great advantage over the other systems.

Mr. S. S. Koder.—The question of Ayurvedic Dispensaries does not arise.

Mr. V. V. Anantapadmanabha Ayyar.—The other has to be very much encouraged. So far as the starting of fresh rural dispensaries are concerned, instead of starting these Allopathic Dispensaries we have to start Ayurvedic Dispensaries and thereby cut short this expenditure. We have got a good number of Ayurvedic Doctors in this State, and we find that sometimes Allopathic Doctors, whenever they fail or when they find in difficulty, they approach these Ayurvedic Doctors for treatment, and in very many cases we find, except in cases where surgery is necessary, that the Ayurveda system of treatment is far better than the Allopathic treatment. I submit that in Travancore this system of Ayurveda is getting much support.

President.—We are not discussing that subject now.

Mr. V.V. Anantapadmanabha Ayyar.—I am submitting that more encouragement has to be given to Ayurvedic treatment, and if we give more encouragement, we need get only less medicine for these hospitals, and further Allopathic Dispensaries need not be started. I want to bring these facts to the notice of the Government.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—There seems to be, in my opinion, some confusion of issues. So far as this point is concerned, I think the Hon'ble Member for Jews said yesterday that he moved his cut motion to show that a committee should be appointed to look into the details of the purchases of medicines, stores and all sorts of things.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I only incidentally stated that a committee may be appointed.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—That was what I understood from the Hon'ble Member—a committee should be appointed for the purpose of looking into the details of the purchase of medicines.

President.—That was also mentioned as one of the objects of his cut.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. M. K. Raman.—I think that is the object of this cut motion. Of course, if we can get medicines cheaper either from the company from which it is purchased now or anywhere else, provided the quality remains the same, nobody says that we should not purchase cheaper. I do not think that the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer would oppose that, if he can get them cheaper, he would not do so. The point in issue is not then the appointment of a committee. Then may I understand what it is?

Dr. A. R. Menon.—So far as my point is concerned, it is because tenders for medicines were not called for that the medicines we have been purchasing are purchased at a higher rate. I purposely brought it to show to and call the attention of the Government that hereafter purchase of medicines can only be done after inviting tenders just as in other Departments. That was my object.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—My point also was the same.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—If it is only for the purpose of inviting tenders for purchase of medicines, I do not suppose the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer will have any objection to such a thing. I would like to know the opinion of the Government about that. I thought it was for the appointment of a committee that the Hon'ble Member for Jews moved his cut.

Mr. A. L. Antony.—I rise to support the motion. In this connection I might say it may be better to get a thing from the agent than from the manufacturer. Cheapness in buying a thing depends upon so many factors, such as the purchaser, the quantity, the quality as well as the seller. I support the main statement made by the Hon'ble Member for Narakkal that when he had been once to Bombay he had purchased a bicycle for Rs. 250 and when he came to Trichur, the Trichur people told him that they would be able to give the same for Rs. 5 less than what he paid at Bombay. It is true. But if that Hon'ble Member had represented to the manufacturers there at Bombay that he would be buying not only one bicycle at that time but 1,000, and also, not for one year, but year after year, then I believe he would not have paid such a price for the same to the Bombay merchant and there would have been no possibility for the Trichur people to tell him that they would be able to give him the same for Rs. 5 less. I bring this fact here to say, that, if a manufacturer gives some discount to an agent, it is on the economic principle that the agent pays more to the manufacturer than a random purchaser. If our Cochin Government convince the manufacturers that they would be purchasing medicines worth Rs. 75,000 and that not for one year, but year after year, then I

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

believe, fi there is any sense of a business man in the manufacturers, then they would readily grant the same discount, which they grant to any other local agent, either in the Madras Presidency or in any other Presidency.

Whether it is cheaper to get a thing from a local agent or from the manufacturers depends not only upon the quantity but upon the name of the buyer also. I may add that, if the purchaser is a Government, as our Cochin Government, I believe that any business man will readily grant a discount, sometimes more than what is paid to a local agent, because it may be in a way an advertisement to him, both inside the State as well as outside it. And it is a pride and honour to that manufacturer if he is the direct supplier of medicine to the Cochin Government, because he can advertise in his bill-notices that he is the direct supplier to the Cochin Government, etc. That itself will show that he is a faithful, confidential and better merchant. So, if the merchants at London are really business men, as we know English men are, they should naturally give a better discount than what they give either to Dadha or Malcolm or to any other company in our State or in the Presidency. So I believe, if better measures are taken by the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer to get medicines directly from the manufacturers at London, we could get them much cheaper. But of course I beg to withdraw my statement if these manufacturers have entered into an agreement with their existing agents that they alone would be considered as their agents. So that would not extend their business to any other in the State or give a better discount. But if that is not the case then, I believe the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer himself will have no objection in getting down medicines directly from the manufacturers so that our Government may be at some advantage.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—Sir, on a point of information. May I know from the Government whether quotations were taken from various firms by the Government before giving orders to a particular firm, or whether it was arbitrarily done by the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer? That is one thing. Another thing on which I should like to have information is whether this system of calling for tenders is current either in British, Travancore or Mysore territories or in any other neighbouring States in the Madras Presidency. Another thing that I wish to know is what exactly were the incidental expenses that we had to pay when medicines were got down from Ferris & Co. These are matters which will be useful for the House before they come to a conclusion. What I want to know is whether quotations were taken from men of standing—I do not

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

care for the quotations from dealers of no standing. We are dealing with important things. If you get doubtful drugs, it would be a very dangerous thing. Have you taken quotations from firms of good standing, both European and Indian? If so, have you given the contracts to the man who quoted the cheapest price consistent with reliability and quality? Another thing is, is any of the Governments of Travancore, British, Mysore, or that of any of our Indian States in South India buying medicines on the tender system?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I shall give you all that information in my reply.

Mr. S. S. Koder.—If the idea is that Government is paying more by getting medicines from Dadha & Co., I would say the best way for the Government to do is to get medicines direct from the manufacturers. It is all bunkum to say that the agents get a large percentage of commission. (*Hear, hear.*) I know for a fact, for medicines the highest discount an agent can get is about 2½ per cent or 3 per cent, not more than that. Unlike orders for watches and cars, all that they get is 2½ per cent on the invoice value, and supposing a manufacturer has got an agent for Madras Presidency, on any order that goes to that particular manufacturer, the agent will get 2½ per cent on all the orders that go from Madras Presidency. So what I say is, if we get direct from the manufacturers, we can certainly get very much cheaper. (*Hear, hear.*) But only you have to pay a certain percentage for the agency to order and to clear the goods from Customs; that is all. If you can order and clear the whole thing yourself, well and good. But I do not think that your Department will be able to do that.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Oh, yes.

Mr. S. S. Koder.—I dont' think you can. How much were you paying to Messrs. Peirce Leslie & Co., Ltd., for clearing? I think you were paying 5 per cent or 10 per cent. That is all very much. It is all mere sham. A respectable local firm you can get by paying 2½ per cent or 3 per cent for ordering and clearing all your goods, to bring it to your custody. (*Hear, hear.*)

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Will you do that?

Mr. S. S. Koder.—I will certainly do that for 2½ per cent. That is more than for any merchant to do. What I want to impress upon you is that we can get for certain very much cheaper if we distribute German orders to Germany and London orders to London; and I am sure, as the Member for Kattur said, if we say that this order will be repeated every year, we will

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

get the best of rates and discount from them and thus we can get much cheaper.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—Let us have the facts connected with the subject which I have asked for.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Shall I deal with the criticisms, Sir?

As regards tenders, it has been replied several times in this Council that supply of medicine to the State by tenders has never been in vogue at any time, and further on another occasion it has been stated that tenders for medical supply is not generally practised by either British Government or any of the Indian States that I know of, neither in Travancore nor Pudukkottai. It was mentioned here in this House that in British India open tenders are made. But what is done there is, a purchasing agent, a reliable purchasing agent, who knows all about the reliability of the various manufacturing firms, is employed for the purchase of stores. For instance, firms of repute and standing and reliability are chosen, and they are asked to send in their quotations, not in the open market, either by tenders or in any other way, in which case it is disastrous. If it is to be purchased directly from England, I have not the slightest objection, and I think you will get the very best article, and if you have got an agent here, certainly we can get them much cheaper. That question about the direct importation of drugs was also moved in this Council. I said that an agency is a *sine qua non* and that this question has also been engaging my attention. It was I who suggested that, if we have a local agent, we could get drugs directly and cheaply. I know as a matter of fact, as expressed by the Hon'ble Member for Mattancheri, that it will certainly be cheaper to get medicines directly from England from the best manufacturer. But generally it involves such an amount of labour and trouble for which we have really no staff, and so that has not taken shape. We were importing medicines at one time from Europe straight from Messrs. Ferris and Company and then we had to engage a European Firm at Cochin to pay Customs duty, to do clearing and forwarding them to their respective destinations. I shall just give you an idea what the amounts of incidental charges were during the time when Government were getting down medicines from Messrs. Ferris and Company during the last three years just before their engagement was discontinued by the State. This is a statement sent up to the Diwan when the change of agency took place. Perhaps I might refer to that later on. The matter which is pertinent now is, during the years 1097, 1098 and 1099

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

we got down medicines for Rs. 1,09,849 directly from Messrs. Ferris & Co.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—How much please ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—For the years 1097 1098 and 1099 we purchased medicines worth Rs. 1,09,849, for which we paid to Messrs. Peirce Leslie and Co. Rs.62,623 including duty and all incidental charges.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—My Lord !

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—That includes Customs duty, clearing charges, commission and all other incidental expenses.

Mr. A. B. Salem.— Can you avoid all that ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I was only saying it includes Customs duty, clearing charges, go-down rent, forwarding charges and everything.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.— Insurance also?

Mr. S. S. Koder.—May I know how much they charged as commission ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I do not know just now. What they claimed, we paid. So that, even in making a comparative statement of the prices of the offers made by Messrs. Dadha and Co. and Ferris and Co. this is just what happened. For the sake of comparison we will take one of the smallest invoice of this 1099, Mala Dispensary, and make a valuation according to Ferris and Co. and Messrs. Dadha and Co..—I may here say that I have not selected this invoice particularly ; I just took one from among the many—. The price when the supply is made at Irinjalakkuda Railway Station which is the closest Railway Station to Mala was:—Messrs. Dadha and Co, Madras, including all cost for delivery at Irinjalakkuda Railway Station charged Rs. 513. Messrs. Ferris and Co. the cost of drugs alone comes to 393 rupees and Customs duties, landing charges, etc., comes to 300 rupees, which comes to a total of 693 rupees. Between Rs. 513 and Rs. 693 there is a profit of Rs. 180 over Rs. 693, which works out to be nearly somewhere 25 per cent or a little more. That is the original reason for changing the agency at the time when allotment for medicine was so rigidly stationary. When medicines were coming in such a large quantity, a slight gain like that would be indeed profitable.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—On a point of information. May I know whether Messrs. Ferris and Co. requested the Senior Medical Officer or at least informed the Senior Medical Officer that they are ready to supply medicine at the cost quoted by Messrs. Dadha and Co ?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—No, not in those terms. The communication is published here.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—If you would look into your papers, I am sure that they did send a communication to that effect. I know for certain because I got a letter from them. I get medicines from Ferris and Co. Knowing that I was in Cochin State, they sent me all the correspondence that passed between the Senior Medical Officer and the firm. There it is clearly stated that they are ready to supply medicine at the price quoted by Messrs. Dadha and Co. or (even less) with a discount.

Mr. K. J. Antony.—May I know whether there is a firm in Travancore by the name of Nair Nair and Co.?

Rao Bahadur Mr. John Kuriyan.—I don't know.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I can tell him yes. They have opened a branch in London, and they have a branch in Madras.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—They have got an office in London, the agent's or proprietor's firm. They had a contract of medicines.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Sir, my point was not answered.

Mr. S. S. Koder.—The supply of medicines to Mala—may I know whether the same was sent by Ferris and Co., whether the consignment contained more liquid, that is, tinctures and all that? Then the duty will be very high. It is only a hypothetical valuation.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—It is the same quality and quantity and valuation.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—My question is not answered. Did you ask for comparative quotations from firms of standing?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I have. There was a question about giving the contract of medicine to Dadha and Co. I do remember answering it here, and I shall read what I have stated in the Karkadagam Session of 1101. It was most carefully investigated for the first time by reference to the published price-lists of other English manufacturing Chemists and Druggists and the leading Indian firms and it was found that Messrs. Dadha and Co.'s terms were more favourable.

Mr. K. P. Kannan Nayar.—I do not think that is calling for quotations, Sir.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—In 1102 I did call for quotations from Hemp and Co., Park Davis and Co., Burgoyne and Co. and from Natham and Co. and Smith, Stany Street, and I found that in some respects the rates were favourable, in other respects were not, and any way from the lot of information received from them I got a revised quotation from Dadha and Co. as compared with their previous rates.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. T. K. Krishna Menon.—Sir, I wish to say one word. I am sure that one aspect of the matter has not been considered by the House. It is not a token motion but a substantial cut for 25 thousand rupees from the allotment intended for the purchase and supply of medicines. Even now there is a dearth of medicines and also a complaint that we are standing creditors to foreign firm. If this cut is allowed, that is to say, if the Member for Jews presses his motion to a division, I am sure our position will be worse. (*Hear, hear*:)

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Sir, the debate has been wound up. I shall give ample money. I do not give my reply. I do not stand in the way of poor people getting sufficient medicine freely in our State. But I am personally of opinion as seen from the figures just now given that 50 thousand rupees worth of medicines is quite sufficient for Cochin State. For three years we got down medicines worth 1,09,000 rupees and 62,000 and odd rupees by way of incidental charges. That amounts to a lakh and 62 thousand rupees. That works just a little over 50 per cent.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Let me correct. There was a lot of medicines which we were getting from other sources. For instance, quinine, the supply for the whole State is obtained from the British Government. Last year I told you that we bought 8,000 rupees worth of quinine. Perhaps at the time referred to here, 1097, 1098 and 1099, it may not have been priced so much. Again castor oil, Rs. 1,200 worth of castor oil is purchased from a Trichur merchant, and there is an allotment to each hospital for bazaar medicines, and that also must go from this allotment, and rectified spirit for making tinctures is obtained from the Trichur Distillery. That goes to explain how very economical that system is and how most favourably it compares with any kind of quotations from even English firms. I will be able to explain. So that 50 thousand rupees that is mentioned to have been paid to Ferris and Co. do not represent the whole expenditure of that year, and further perhaps it is not known here that out of this allotment of Rs. 75,000 somewhere to 2,000 or 2,500 Rs. goes for the purchase of anti-rabic vaccination, etc. which is a big slice.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—May I know from you, Sir, whether at the time 1097 to 1099, accounts of which you mentioned, whether castor oil, quinine and all that did not come from the same company in 1097 to 1099 of which you gave accounts. Of course, since then we are getting castor oil from Trichur, tinctures manufactured here, that is all in your time. At the time

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

the figures of which you furnished, were not all these things coming direct ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—No. When I came here, that was the practice.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Tinctures were being manufactured here.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Castor oil, terpentine and glycerine, etc., were from out side. For years it has been so. It is under the instructions of the Madras Government.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I have got the figures, and if you look into the budget of previous years, the supply started from 36,000 Rs. and went up to 60,000 Rs. and never more than 65,000 Rs. I have not been able to put my finger upon any budget that went over 65,000 Rs. so far. Of course the bills come after Karkadagam is over. Therefore these sums went on recurring from one year to another year. But apart from all that, I do not want to stand in the way of medicines being supplied to the poor people. If that is necessary, let it be granted by the House, and I shall reduce my cut to a token cut of 10 Rs. or 1 Re. upon the principle that our medicines must be got by means of tenders in England and by means of a local agent from here. We have heard the statement from the Hon'ble Member for Mattancheri that at a 2 ½% commission, which is the lowest that anybody can get, he is prepared to do the whole work (*hear, hear*). We have also heard the statement (we do not know) from the Chief Medical Officer that he has made a report for deviation. What is the percentage that was being made to Messrs. Peirce Leslie and Co. as their commission ? No doubt it was put there as 62,000 Rs. without taking into account the large amount of duty that anybody has to pay, to get things from outside, into this country. We do not know the figures ; but it does not matter. You might have done it with the best of intentions to make savings for the Government. But, if that money is to go outside of our State, I certainly object. If you can get a local agent here; give him something for doing work for our own country. Our country's work must be done by our own people, whatever goes must go to that people, from whom you take this money (*hear, hear*). Therefore, Sir, I reduce this, with your permission, to 1 Re. upon principle that, if there are any local people, preferably Cochinites, they must be given this work, and the tenders with price-lists from England—original or from manufacturers of standing, status, and repute and reliability—should be called for and all those catalogues compared and the prices arrived at and the local

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

agent should be asked to get from such and such places unless he can get them cheaper.

Mr. S. S. Koder.—The Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer has no objection to send it to Europe. He says that that would be cheaper.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Therefore, Sir, on that principle I wish to divide the House. In British India the medical stores are purchased in England by the India Office.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—There is an agency there.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—And the Special Finance Committee have also proposed that the medium of purchase should be the calling in for tenders—by open tenders. Whether and how it should be done is a different matter. I do not want to take any more time upon this cut. It has been sufficiently well discussed, and I do not want to dwell upon the necessity of a commercial agent for Cochin as it ought to be. Upon that I will come some other time. I wish to divide the House only upon the 1 Re token cut, with your permission, upon the principle that local men should be encouraged and that the tenders must be made public in places where these medicines are actually manufactured and the best prices obtained.

Mr. M. K. Raman.—Has the Government any objection to that?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Absolutely no objection at all in that matter. There was only the question that the charge of the agency was wrong. That is the only point that I am going to argue. Then as regards getting medicines direct from England with an agency here is a matter, as I told you before, which has been engaging my attention, and I wanted to see whether we can adopt that procedure profitably.

Mr. S. S. Koder.—Let us try for a year.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Government wants the best article, and when it was mentioned in this House that we should ask for open tenders in the market, I just bring to notice a catalogue to explain to this House that we would be making a fatal mistake. For instance, some of the samples sold in the Indian market are not of B. P. standard. There are many spurious salts which are sold in the market as genuine. As for the matter of iron and quinine which are imported into India, it is said to be spurious because it contains less than 5 per cent of quinine. I was simply startled to read that most of these medicines could not be administered with public safety. Unfortunately, the drug business of late is going into the hands of a class of people who are ignorant of the essentials of medicines. Owing to keen competition, some of the drugs are of inferior

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

quality, and commercial firms are in the hands of people who are ignorant of the standard of medicines.

Mr. E. Ikkanda Warriar.—Is it not an advertisement that my friend is reading?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—This is a notice given in a catalogue.

Mr. E. Ikkanda Warriar.—Every seller will say that his article is the best.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—If we purchase all sorts of things, I do not want to say who are the authorities. Let me hear all those things about quinine, which contains only 3 to 5 per cent of quinine.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—The agreement with Dadha and Co. is that tinctures are to be sent here directly from Burgoyne and Burbidges and Co. to Cochin Port. They do give 5 per cent discount over the published price of the latest catalogue of Burgoyne's.

Mr. S. S. Koder.—I wish to say something on that matter. How do you know the published prices of Burgoyne? How do you work it out? You have to pay duty and all that.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—We do it ourselves.

Mr. S. S. Koder.—I do not think you will be able to do that.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—In respect of the quality of drugs, I am constrained to make a statement here. Some of our magnesium salts supplied to local dispensaries are far inferior. Persons who take that magnesium sulphate generally get gastric intestinal trouble, dysentery, etc. This shows that the quality supplied is far inferior.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Let me give a personal experience of what happened in the Pudukkad Dispensary. They have got tinctures of medicines for heart-disease. There was a consumptive patient, and the Doctor gave him six doses of the medicine. The patient found that it had no effect on him. He informed me of the same, and I said 'get some medicine from Trichur'. He got the same from Trichur and he took two doses and his heart began to work properly and he was able to bring the illness under control. I found out from the label of the medicines kept in the dispensary that they were got down neither from Burgoyne nor from Park Davies, but they were from an Indian market, and I know the man who got them. When we find fault with the medicines, we are answered 'see some of the advertisements.' I have the copy, and I know the name of the firm. I know the manufacturer, and I know also the agent. It is not

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Dadha and Company. Dadha and Company have got another agent, and it is he who has got that drug. The Department knows the name of the man, and you know the man. (*Laughter.*)

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Yes. The explanation is cheapness and demand. There was a demand for the medicines and I did so. I placed the order with Bose's Laboratory for Indian Doctors, Calcutta. I do not know if that be a bad place for getting medicines. There is a clamour from the mofussil that they want more medicines, and I thought, if it is cheaper, I might satisfy them.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—By supplying such spurious drugs, you are killing the people, and not curing them.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Cheapness should not be the criterion of the quality of drugs.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—No. But we have only a small allotment, and we want a large quantity of medicines also.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—It should be consistent with purity of the drug also. I can also multiply instances where the drugs supplied to our hospitals and dispensaries proved injurious. I only want to bring to the notice of this House that the medicines supplied by Messrs. Dadha & Co., are of very inferior quality. The bicarbonate of soda and sulphate of magnesia supplied to our Medical Institutions are very crude indeed. I have known many cases of Gastro-enteritis followed by the use of sulphate of magnesia as purgative. Soda Bicarb which is also known as washing soda is not fit even for washing purposes much less for the internal administration.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—May we know who supplies the drugs necessary for the Veterinary Hospitals? Government must know that we are as responsible in making this statement as the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer. You should know that we are making statements against firms of reputation and standing. So far as I am concerned, from 1099 onwards, I have found out this state of affairs in every hospital; that is, the medicines supplied are not good. Every doctor will say that. But I do not want to mention the names of those persons. It is why I brought this matter to the notice of the House.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Will the Government adopt the new principle in 1104? I also want to know whether the contract for medicines has been given out.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I am afraid it is too late. I told you that I do not think there will be sufficient time to get quotations from European firms and orders for medicines. We have medicines only up to November. It

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

will be very difficult for us to get medicines from European firms within that time. For medicines you have to write to Messrs. Burgoyne and Burgoyne & Co., or other well-known firms. If the medicines will reach here in two months' time, I have not the slightest objection. There are difficulties for contracts of medicines, and, therefore, orders will have to be placed at once.

I may also say that I have not placed the indents for 1104.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Will the Government be pleased to bring this system in force after this grant is allowed by the House? If they agree, I withdraw. Otherwise I press my cut. I have no objection at all to withdraw my cut.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I have no objection at all if it is possible to arrange to deliver the medicines within two or three months. I have not the slightest objection if the supply could be arranged for within the end of November even, till which time the present stock of medicines may hold out.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—You have medicines for three months more. It is possible for us to supply the medicines within November from any of the European firms, Messrs. Park Davies, Burgoyne and Burgoyne, Ferris and Co., or any European manufacturer. (*Hear, hear.*)

There is no difficulty in these things. I am not at all satisfied that there are difficulties. What I mean to say is, if the contracts have been given in anticipation of the demands here, what is the use?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I am not giving contracts for 1104.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—When do you want these medicines?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—The latest within the next three months.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—A cablegram will go and you can get the medicines.

President.—Do you withdraw?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—If that is accepted for 1104, I withdraw. I don't know whether it is accepted.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—We shall try. That is all what I can tell you. I don't know what can be done.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—These well-known firms of Park Davies & Co., and other manufacturers, whose prices never vary and whose goods are not inferior, if you take direct from them, medicines from these people must be got through local agents. Will the Hon'ble Member be prepared to place an order with those local agents?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Why not direct?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—By all means, we want it.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—You emphasise 'local agents'.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I shall do what can be done.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—That is a different matter to the Members. If the cut is passed, they can do what they like. I don't know whether the Government of Cochin is going to do like that.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—All that I can say is that I approve of the principle, and I shall try to put it into practice at once.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—That is all.

(*The motion was, with leave, withdrawn.*)

Motion No. 3.

Mr. C. J. Mathew.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 3,60,220 for "Hospitals" by Re. 1.*

President.—Motion No. 3, Mr. C. J. Mathew.

Mr. C. J. Mathew.—I brought this cut to inform the House about the scanty supply of medicines to our mofussil hospitals, especially to the Chalakkudi Hospital, which, being surrounded by forests and other hilly tracts, attracts any amount of patients every day. The supply is certainly not sufficient to meet the demands. Not only in Chalakkudi but I understand that is the complaint in all the mofussil hospitals in this matter —both in the case of the supply of surgical instruments as well as in the supply of necessary medicines. Even the poorest patient, who goes to the hospital, is asked to go to the nearest shop and purchase medicines there if he really wants to get cured. Otherwise some sort of water mixture is given him which is absolutely of no effect ,as the Hon'ble Member for Trichur has pointed out already. That exactly is the present state of affairs in Cochin and I want more medicines and surgical instruments to be supplied to our hospitals in the State hereafter.

Another point that I wish to strongly advocate is the opening of a Dental Department in our General Hospital here. The private practitioners are charging the poor patients very high. Those who have to clean their teeth or stuff their teeth are charged from Rs. 5 to Rs. 10.

Mr. C. Barton Wright.—Who charges that?

Mr. C. J. Mathew.—The Japanese Dentist Mr. Nishmura.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Another man may charge Rs. 100. You should not mention the name.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. C. J. Mathew.—I have no objection to withdraw the name. All that I meant was, it is very difficult, as it is, to satisfy the needs of the poor patients who suffer from the diseases of teeth. This is a necessity absolutely and urgently felt, and I, therefore, request the Government to start a Dental Department in the General Hospital. It won't cost them very much.

If possible the opening of another Department also, I may suggest. That is the "ear, nose and throat" Department which has lately been introduced into the Madras General Hospital. We have Ex-Ray and other Departments here. This demand is more keenly felt by the people. On these things I wish to know the opinion of the Government.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Not exactly that all these Departments should be started. Suppose a gentleman, a private practitioner says that he is willing to work for two years. Will the Government allow him to work? Our objection is in creating posts for medical men, when medical men are willing to come forward and offer their services. Why do you object?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.— No objection at all.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I know you did object. If you had shown a little sympathy to the independent profession in this country, things would have been different. Even in Madras, they are contemplating to do that. Private doctors should be allowed to practise, so that the patients may choose whom they like. All that we ask is that we must be allowed to make use of facilities that Government Hospitals offer. Why this jealousy?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—No jealousy at all. These expressions are unfounded.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—It is quite unfortunate. I shall be able to prove it. Even the Special Finance Committee's decision was over, and Mr. C. Achyuta Menon, who objected, simply recapitulated all the clauses in the Bill. Is it fair? You must look from a medical point of veiw. I have been representing in this House half a dozen times, hundred times, that they are refusing the services of private doctors. Have you offered any such facilities? Is it not a sufficient guarantee? Why not Government realise that poor medical men, who are being damned by this method of over-crowding the hospitals, must be given all facilities, pay, etc. When Mr. Nishimora is willing to come, when Mr. Paul, eye specialist,—

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—No names.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Dr. A. R. Menon.—There is no harm. I don't connect their names. If such capable men are willing to come and work in your office, why do you object to that?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—There is no objection.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I am very glad that it has been vouchsafed in this House for the first time.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—It has been repeated here times out of number.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—That is only a matter of carrying on business. You have no Ear and Nose Departments. Provided men with the requisite qualification come forward to work in your hospitals honorarily, when they are willing to do that, Government has no business to create that Department and pay out of public funds.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.— Do I understand from the speech that the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer has been standing in the way of obtaining specialists for helping him?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.— Not in the least.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—If that were so, it would be very wrong.

If the eminent dental surgeon is available and consented to work honorarily, certainly it would be wrong if his offer is not accepted. If a good dental specialist, and an ear, nose and throat specialist is available, by all means let us have them. Nobody is enamoured of paying when it is avoidable. If you get honorary men, by all means get them. If you cannot, let us try and get paid men.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—No objection at all. If suitable persons are forthcoming, there is not the slightest objection. That principle has been enunciated on more occasions than one, and I have, whenever any one has come, offered facilities for him.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I have the authority to mention that Mr. Paul, who is an authority on eye diseases, is willing to come. I openly proclaim it. Let us see what you would do by next year's budget time.

Mr. C. J. Mathew.— May I know whether the Government has any objection to invite the dental doctor to work in the General Hospital?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I am not the authority. No question of inviting. He may offer.

Mr. C. J. Mathew.—That is all right.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Will the Government be pleased to advertise to that effect? You simply say there is a vacancy in the

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Dental Department. Any gentleman with the requisite qualification willing to do the work on honorary considerations, please forward the application. We shall do some such thing. With certain respect and dignity nobody will come and ask.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—We are prepared to advertise.

(*The motion was, with leave, withdrawn.*)

Motion No. 4.

Mental Hospitals.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 200 for "recreation" by Re. 1.*

President.—Motion No. 4, Mr. A. B. Salem.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—In the Standing Finance Committee, I wanted to know how the Rs. 200 for recreation was being spent. May I know from the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer whether he has got the information ready? I put it in the cut motion also. Why this looking up, Sir?

I would bring to your notice one glaring thing that I saw in the Cochin *Civil List* Medical Staff. I find here the name of a gentleman in the service, who has been to England and who qualified himself and who has got a larger number of years of service to his credit, drawing much less pay than some others who are of less numbers of years of service and who have only Indian qualifications. To make the point clear, I refer to Mr. Babu Rao. Of course the minorities have no representatives except we, minorities, and, therefore, it is that I thought fit to mention it and pass on. Dr. Babu Rao, you see from *the Civil List*, is drawing Rs. 110. He has got to his credit 10 years 8 months and 27 days service on the 1st of Kumbham 1103, and I take another gentleman H. Narayana Kamath, who has got only 9 years of service and who is a locally qualified man getting Rs 135. I don't wish to mention other names because it might be thought that I am also communally inclined. I find several Christian gentlemen from the least drawing Rs. 140, Rs. 160, Rs. 135, etc., and all of them are Indian-trained men. I think this is a matter which I feel is not correct. It has been held out by the Cochin Government, to my knowledge, that medical men in the service, who take the trouble to qualify themselves with higher studies in England, would be suitably provided for. There was such an undertaking by the Government at the time of Mr. Banerji and Mr. Bhore.

President.—On a point of order. Are we allowed to discuss such things?

Mr. T. K. Krishna Menon.—May I remind the Member for the Jews that, in his cut motion, the object for it he has put

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

down is "to know how the amount set apart for recreation is spent in the Mental Hospital"?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—On that alone I want to speak. My cut motion is for many purposes. I take my allotted time for my cut motion. He is hunting up for the information.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I have got the information.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—From the Standing Finance Committee I am asking. Therefore, that is all upon that point. I want you to look into these matters that the minorities are not looked upon properly. I don't put the blame upon A, B, C, D. In the matter of recreation, may I know what this amount is for?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Special treats are given to the lunatics on the Thiruvonam day, His Highness' birthday, Christmas, New Years' Day, Vishu, etc. That comes to Rs. 93 in 1102, Rs. 82 in 1103. Some amount is spent on the vegetable garden attached to the premises of the Lunatic Asylum. Last year, for cleaning the well, for implements for cutting, spades, etc., money was spent. Then there was fencing. For the last two years, weaving on a small scale as a recreation has been introduced. They did weaving very well indeed. I am glad to inform this House that we have been trying to make some proper use of it by getting the inmates to prepare all dusters and towels for the Department. Yarn for that cost Rs. 63 in 1102, and Rs. 83 in 1103, and then again, the inmates are also given some betel leaf, tobacco and areca-nut and all that for Rs. 10.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Any income from the vegetable garden?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Rs. 75 from the vegetable garden and Rs. 407 from the weaving.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Sir, that is all right. There is something not all right. (*Laughter.*)

I have been informed most credibly by the Hon'ble Member, the Secretary to the Diwan, that that money was spent for a gramaphone! I never heard anyting about it. I got another kind of information.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—I said it was sanctioned.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—It is sanctioned only for next year.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I don't press the cut.

(*The motion was, with leave, withdrawn.*)

Motion No. 5.

Mr. A. B Salem.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 1,462 for "Establishment, Leper Asylum" by Re. 1.*

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

President.—Motion No. 5, Mr. A. B. Salem.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—This is a very important matter. It has been a subject on which I have been trying my level best in this House for the poor lepers. The condition of the Venduruthy Leper Asylum is deplorable and miserable. That has been admitted in this House by the Hon'ble Member for Medicine. He himself has said that. I do not know what kind of word he used, 'deplorable' also he used. It has come to a point when it cannot be tolerated. I was not at all satisfied. I should say that provision was made in 1101 for starting another Leper Asylum to remove it in order that the Leper Asylum may not go to Anappara. Long before this House came into existence, Diwan Mr. Narayana Menon, when he passed orders on the Anappara scheme, stated that the money that the public subscribed will be deposited in the National Bank of India with interest to allow it to be accumulated, so that another Sankariah Home may be provided elsewhere, when a suitable Leper Asylum is built. I ask the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer to-day what is the amount now to the credit of that fund in the Bank with interest.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I cannot say offhand.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Make inquiries. There are plenty of papers. The Account Department is here. They know the investment and what rate it is carrying. These subscriptions were invited from the members of the public for the purpose and upon the promise that a home for the untainted children of lepers will be provided. Now the question of the Anappara scheme is abandoned once for all. I take it that we cannot help that. In spite of all our efforts, Government will not be moved. The poor scheme is coming up only slowly.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—Buildings are also goingup.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Some provision ought to be made. The question of the home for the untainted children of lepers should be duly considered. I don't press.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—He has withdrawn the cut.

(*The motion was, with leave, withdrawn.*)

Motion No. 6.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 1,999 for "Miscellaneous" under Leper Asylum by Re. 1*

President.—Motion No. 6. Mr. A. B. Salem.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I withdraw.

(*Hence it was considered withdrawn.*)

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Motion. No. 7.

Mr. A. S. Harihara Ayyar.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 3,33,500 under "Demand No. XXI by" Re 1.*

President.—Motion No. 7, Mr. Harihara Ayyar, absent.

(*Hence it was considered withdrawn.*)

Motion No. 8

Mr. C. V. Kuriyan.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 3,33,500 under "Demand No. XXI by" Rs. 3,000.*

President.—Motion No. 8, Mr. C. V. Kuriyan.

Mr. C. V. Kuriyan.—I don't move.

(*Hence the motion was considered withdrawn.*)

Motion No. 9.

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 3,33,500 under "Demand No. XXI by" Re. 1.*

മിസ്റ്റർ ടി. എ. രാമചന്ദ്രയ്യർ.—സർ, ഈ നാട്ടിൽ, പേപ്പട്ടികടിച്ചാൽ ചികത്സിക്കുന്നതിനു മുമ്പു് സൌകര്യം ഉണ്ടായിരുന്നില്ല. അവരെ കുന്നരിലേയ്ക്കു് കൊണ്ടുപോവുകയായിരുന്നു പതിവു്. അവക്കു് വണ്ടിക്കൂലിയും ചിലവുകളും ഗവമ്മെണ്ടു് വെറുതെ കൊടുത്തിരുന്നു. ഈ അടുത്ത കാലത്താണല്ലൊ നമ്മുടെ ജനറൽ ആശുപത്രിയിൽ പേപ്പട്ടിവിഷത്തിനും ചികിത്സ ആരംഭിച്ചതു്. ഈയിടയിൽ മിഥുനമാസത്തിലൊ ഇടവമാസത്തിലൊ അടുത്തെന്നതോന്നുന്നു, മുകുന്ദപുരം താലൂക്കിൽ ഒരു പട്ടി അഞ്ചുപേരെ കടിക്കുകയുണ്ടായി. അവർ അഞ്ചുപേരും ചികിത്സയ്ക്കായി ഉടനെ എറണാകുളത്തു വന്നു. ഇവിടെ കുറെനാൾ ചികിത്സിച്ചതിന്റെ ശേഷം സുഖമായി എന്നും പറഞ്ഞു് അവരെ വീടുകളിലേയ്ക്കു മടക്കി അയച്ചു. അവർ വീടുകളിലെത്തി ഏ ദിവസം കഴിഞ്ഞ ഉടനെ ഒരാൾക്കു് വിഷബാധകൊണ്ടുള്ള ഉപദ്രവം തുടങ്ങി, അധികമാവുകയും പേ ഇളകി അയാൾ മരിച്ചുപോവുകയും ചെയ്തു. ആ വിവരം ഉടനെ എറണാകുളം ആശുപത്രിയിലേക്കു റിപ്പോർട്ടു ചെയ്തു. അതിനു കിട്ടിയ മറുപടി, ഒരാൾ മരിച്ചു എന്നുവെച്ചു് ബാക്കിയുള്ളവർ പേടിക്കേണ്ട, സുഖക്കേടു ഉണ്ടാവുകയില്ല, എന്നായിരുന്നു. ഈ സംഭവത്തിനുശേഷം നാലഞ്ചു ദിവസം കഴിഞ്ഞു് രണ്ടാമതും ഒരാൾക്കു് പേ ഇളകി. അയാളും ഉടൻ മരിച്ചുപോവുകയാണുണ്ടായതു്. അതും റിപ്പോർട്ടുചെയ്തു. എന്നിട്ടും ബാക്കിയുള്ളവർ ചികിത്സിക്കേണ്ട, സുഖക്കേടു ഉണ്ടാവുകയില്ല എന്നായിരുന്നു സമാധാനം. ഈ സമാധാനം എത്തുമ്പോഴേക്കും വേറൊരാളും ഈ ഉപദ്രവംകൊണ്ടു് മരിച്ചു. ഉടനെ ബാക്കിയുള്ളവർ നമ്മുടെ ആശുപത്രിയിലെ മറുപടിയെ ഒന്നും ആവശ്യപ്പെടാതേയും വിശ്വസിച്ചു് രക്ഷാതേയും പോത്തന്നൂരോ എവിടെയൊ ചെന്നു് ആയുർവ്വേദ ചികിത്സ നടത്തി. അതുകൊണ്ടു് അവർ രണ്ടുപേരും ഭാഗ്യവശാൽ മരിക്കാതെ ഇരിക്കുന്നുണ്ടു്. ഇതിനെ

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

പ്പറ്റി കുന്തരിൽ എഴുതിച്ചോദിച്ചതിൽ നൂറിനു വല്ലതും ഒന്നു വീതമേ മരിച്ചു എന്നു വരികയുള്ളൂ, അധികം മരണം ഉണ്ടാവുകയില്ല എന്നായിരുന്നു അവരുടെ മറുപടി. ഇവിടെ ഇത്ര അധികം മരണത്തിനു കാരണം ചികിത്സയിലുള്ള അശ്രദ്ധയാണെന്നു് അവരുടെ മറുപടികൊണ്ടു് ശങ്കിക്കേണ്ടിയിരിക്കുന്നു. ഇതിനെ ശവമ്മെണ്ടിന്റെ ശ്രദ്ധയിൽ കൊണ്ടുവരുന്നതിനാണു് ഞാൻ ഈ ഉപക്ഷേപം അയച്ചിട്ടുള്ളതു്. ഇതിനു കാരണം എന്താണെന്നു് ബഹുമാനപ്പെട്ട ശവമ്മെണ്ടുമെംബർ പറഞ്ഞാൽ കൊള്ളാം.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—It is true. The facts stated by the Hon'ble Member for Nellayi are true. As a matter of fact, 5 patients, who had been bitten by a rabid dog, were treated here about March or April last. I got the information of the first case of death, and I immediately wrote to Coonoor about that incident And within a few days, I got a second letter that a second man was also dead. I informed the Director of Pasteur Institute. I myself was feeling uncomfortable about it and I asked him if there is anything further to be done to the others. He replied, in almost the same strain as the Hon'ble Member mentioned, that nothing further had to be done. All that we can do is to give the protective inoculation and one or two per cent may die. That is all. I don't think I can say any more upon the subject. I can only assure you that it is not due to the result of injection. That I can tell him.

Mr. C. J. Mathew.—How many cases of mortality were brought before you of these people ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I cannot say offhand. I have heard of one or two cases.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Not a very large per cent.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—May I know how many cases were treated last year by antirabic injection ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—About 600 people. I am not sure.

മിസ്റ്റർ. ടി. എ. രാമചന്ദ്രയ്യർ.—ഞാൻ ഉപക്ഷേപം പിൻവലിക്കുന്നു.

(*The motion was, with leave, withdrawn.*)

Motion No. 10.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 3,33,500 under "Demand No. XXI by' Re. 1.*

Dr. A. R. Menon.—The object of this motion is to call the attention of the Government to the appointment of an unpassed hand as the Head Clerk of the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer's office. Government will say that we are going to deal with this subject in all Departments. Incidentally, the Medical Department being the first among the Departments that we are going to deal with, we are hearing the first case. The

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

name of the gentleman is Mr. Kunjikrishna Menon, his qualification, failed Matriculate and Lower Subordinate in Sanitary Engineering with about 15 years' service. In this case objection is raised not only in the matter of appointment, but in the various processes through which the appointment has gone, and also the way the directions given by the Huzur were set aside and the way in which, in defiance of their direction, the appointment was made.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—How did you see ?

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I shall proceed step by step.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—It is not in the power of the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer to set aside the orders of the Huzur.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—"In defiance of the directions". Please observe the word " directions".

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—I take objection to the words. " The Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer set aside directions or orders" whatever it may be.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—That is my objection also. Otherwise there is no objection. I am saying that the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer set aside the directions. Kindly listen to me and I shall answer you.

This is the process. He was a draughtsman in the Department, and that post was abolished when the Minor Engineering was transferred to Panchayats. Dr. Verghese, the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer, proposed him as the Head Clerk. There was another man acting in that post. So he was kept as the draughtsman till the Head Clerk retired. When the Head Clerk retired, his name was proposed. The Diwan refused it on the ground that it violates Standing Order No. 1, the minimum qualification being a Matriculate. According to Standing Order No. 1, can you kindly note that, he is never to be appointed to the Head Clerk's post.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—But he has some other qualifications.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—But the applicant in this case was a non-matriculate and he was refused to be appointed. Then, the Chief Medical Officer replied that the man has got the necessary qualification ; he has passed the draughtsman's tests, and he is in need of a draughtsman in the Department, and he recommended that he should be appointed in the same post. Now, as far as I can see, when the Agricultural Department got this work, the work for a draughtsman was not of a very serious nature. The only work at the time was the work in connection with Kunnamkulam. But he mentioned—there comes the point—" I have no confidence in any one else". I am surprised that the Heads

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

of Departments, who ought to come here and espouse the cause of their subordinates, should make such remarks that "I have confidence only in this person and in no one else". Sir, do they realise by that simple word what harm they are doing to the other subordinates? I hold brief for none but I want to see that these things are rectified, and Heads of Departments must not, in a fit of affection for one of their subordinates (I am putting it mildly) or enthusiasm for one of their subordinates, overlook the rules laid down for their guidance by the Government and use their personal influence to set aside the rules and appoint a person whom they like. Standing Order No. 1 clearly states that non-matriculates should not be appointed.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—He was given exemption.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—In a similar case in the Trichur Municipality, when we applied, we were informed that the Government did not like the idea of asking for exemption. They wrote for exemption for four or five people. The appointment is not pensionable, and naturally the Council would have liked to give them exemption. But we thought it better not to violate the Standing Order, and we did not press the question. What is the use of the Standing Order, if the Heads of Departments are working like this, and where is the security for the subordinates that a day will come when they will get a lift? What have the other people done to forfeit the confidence of the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer, and what has he done to forfeit their confidence in him? Sir, this sort of appointment, I submit, is not consistent, either with the dignity of the gentlemen who constitute the Government on the other side or consistent with fairness, with a sense of justice, with a sense of humanity, or with, pardon me, decency. I wanted to bring this to your notice and press upon the Government that such vexatious cases should not be allowed to recur and Government should treat every one alike, irrespective of any personal consideration whatsoever. For me there is nothing personal about this gentleman, whom I do not know.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I can hardly answer this, because the Hon'ble Member has been presuming such a lot of imaginary things for which I am not in a position to offer a reply here; for instance, that I have used my personal influence and all that sort of thing.

The gentleman referred to was a draughtsman of about 10 or 14 years' service in my office and was doing very good work and was about to be thrown out of employment. He was other-

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

wise a most efficient hand, a very honest man, reliable, able to write good drafts, and I considered him to be the best hand that I have in my office to succeed the Head Clerk, who had retired. I just brought this to the notice of the Government by simply suggesting that his case required special consideration on account of the fact that he was forfeiting his appointment, and was going out of service altogether, after having put in 14 years' service. Mind, he was drawing already the same pay to which he has now been appointed. Where is the partiality, personal influence, or anything like that? You call it undignified. Is that undignified ?

Mr. C. Barton Wright.—No. Certainly not.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I have no power of appointment in this matter. I had only power of recommendation. I put the matter before the Diwan and the appointment was made.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—As a special case.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—May I ask the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer whether he got a communication from the Government asking him to make a fresh nomination, when he recommended this gentleman?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—All that is understood. Government knows all that. They pointed out to me that he was not a passed hand, and I only said, if Government could give him exemption for the qualification which I brought forward, well and good.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—"The Medical Officer is requested to furnish fresh names", that was the communication. Is it not so?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I do not think so.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—He was requested to suggest other names, and then he used his personal influence in his favour.

Mr. T. K. Krishna Menon.—Personal influence in the sense that he knows the qualifications of his own subordinates better than anyone else.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I think the Chief Medical Officer knows how to paraphrase it.

Mr. T. K. Krishna Menon.—I do not see why *I* also should not do it.

Rao Bahadur Mr. John Kuriyan.—Sir, recently I had to deal with the question of the interpretation of this rule of prescribing qualifications in suggesting a revision of *the P. W. D. Code.* Government prescribe that certain qualifications are the minimum qualifications for certain posts. That is a very good thing. We are going to appoint a raw man, who knows

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

nothing about the man, so that we say he must be a man who has passed such and such an examination. Suppose after 20 years' working with a man we think he is a good man, we don't want to know what the University thought of him 20 years previously. Take the case of an engineer. When we engage a raw man we say he must have passed the B. E. or some other examination. Suppose I had that man for 20 years under me; if he is qualified, I will appoint him to a post for which I think he is qualified, because 20 years' experience will show a great deal more than a paper produced from an examination hall (*hear, hear*). I can mention a case in which a man, who was working under me as a day-labourer for 8 annas a day, is to-day an Assistant Engineer and a distinguished officer in Travancore Service. He qualified himself not by passing a University Examination in engineering but by his work. In the revision of *the P. W. Code* I suggested for the consideration of the Government these facts and said this rule is intended primarily for first appointments. It should not fetter the discretion of the Government in appointing officers with a long service whom they know are capable.

(*The motion was, with leave, withdrawn.*)

Motions Nos. 12 and 13.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 3,33,500 under "Demand No. XXI" by Re. 1.*

Dr. A. R. Menon.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 3,33,500 under "Demand No. XXI" by Re. 1.*

President.—Motion No. 12, Dr. A. R. Menon.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Sir, it is to discuss the unsatisfactory administration of the Medical Department that I have tabled this motion. Many of the aspects that I would have discussed have already been discussed, and I only want to bring one important point to the notice of the Government. There is a rule that, after three years, all the subordinate officers must be transferred from place to place. I put a question on this very topic year before last, I believe, in this House, and this was the answer. "Whether there is any rule regarding the posting of Medical Officers for a particular period in one and the same place", and then it goes on. And the answer is 'the order is appended, vide Appendix A.' That is "Government consider that it would be a wholesome rule if Medical Officers below the rank of a Civil Surgeon are not ordinarily allowed to remain in a place for more than three years at a time. The Chief Medical Officer is requested to see that periodical transfers are suggested accordingly". During the supplementary question that followed, I specially mentioned two names, and asked why they

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

were retained and the answer of the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer was that they were indispensable. Now the two names are Messrs. Poulose and Ittoop. As a result of that question, almost all the officers were transferred from place to place with certain exceptions which I can understand; for example, Mr. Raman Menon of Trippunittura, there is a clause in the order "not ordinarily allowed." I interpret that to mean any special case like that of Mr. Raman Menon who is attending in person on His Highness the Maharaja. That I can understand; but what happened here? I put these questions, specially pointing out these two officers who are retained in the General Hospital, one of whom was the Chief Medical Officer's Assistant at the time when he was carrying on private practice. I said it does not look nice that these two persons should be retained indefinitely in the General Hospital, because there is a point in this. In a General Hospital like this, it is but fair that all the Medical Officers should be given a chance to come and study and understand the practical work, of course, they have studied all this practical work before, no doubt; but occasionally just to revise the things. Strangely enough, these two names alone were retained, and the two gentlemen are even to-day in the General Hospital. Now, is it not an actual defiance? I cannot use another word. The President asked the question, "Why do you violate these rules, why don't you follow these rules". That is the question he asked. Then, he said there was some difficulty in transferring them, and so they were kept there. That was just the answer. What happened? These two were retained, while even ladies were transferred to other places. The sense of duty of the Medical Officer was such that a lady working here was transferred and separated from her husband. What is the meaning of that? Such is the sense of duty of the Hon'ble Member that he could not see the husband and wife together—because his sense of duty compels him to separate the wife from the husband! Such a sense of duty, such a sense of honour, was forgotten when it came to his own pet boys! I am sorry to speak so harshly, but I speak so, because the subordinates are complaining about the partial system or the wrong system of the Government I would espouse the cause of the subordinates against him. There must be an end to it. Discontent is rampant in the Department, because of this partiality, rightly or wrongly believed to be partiality. It may be partiality or may not be partiality. The subordinates think that there are a favoured few who are kept there, who can do what they like. Not only that. There was an allowance question, the allowance was divided and one of the claimants for the allowance was one of these gentlemen here

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

There is another cut motion standing in my name, and I shall move both together. The cut motion is to call the attention of the Government for not having a Civil Surgeon in the General Hospital, with 180 beds. Yesterday, it was said that this Hospital is looking after 3½ lakhs of people. The population of Cochin is 10 lakhs and ⅛ is on the sick list!. In such a big institution there is not a single Civil Surgeon to take charge of this Department, when the Chief Medical Officer goes on circuit. Does the House consider this the proper way of managing? Does the Chief Medical Officer think that is the proper way of managing the Hospital, and that he can do the work without a Civil Surgeon? Two or three Civil Surgeons were sent out. Why is it that no Civil Surgeon has been appointed in their place? There are two men with the requisite qualifications in the Department, Mr. Joseph and Mr. Rao. They have fulfilled all the conditions necessary to satisfy your requirements? Why is it that either of them is not appointed to act as Civil Surgeon for a year or two till the permanent incumbent returns? I hope the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer will gladly answer that question.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—You mean Mr. Babu Rao?

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Yes. They are the only two English qualified doctors here. I do not think Government should keep this as a general rule, for English qualification is not any the better than Indian qualification. But any way that is the rule, and those two gentlemen are satisfying the conditions. Now Mr. Babu Rao gets Rs. 180. Can you not show some consideration to him at least? Let him have the consolation of having worked as Civil Surgeon for one year, though permanency is out of the question. They have got various grievances, and when a permanent appointment came, their claims were overridden and even in an acting appointment, you think, they are unfit to be Civil Surgeons. Check them out, if they are incompetent; if they are competent give them what is their due. This Hospital is not the private property of anybody, and it should not be confined to one family.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I object to it. He must withdraw.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I shall prove that this Head of the Department was responsible for creating a Department in the General Hospital for appointing his son.

Mr. C. Barton Wright.—I think it is getting too far. It is quite improper.

President.—The Member will withdraw the remark.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—In due deference to you, Sir, I withdraw.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Now, why is it that these two men, one of whom has served the State for 14 years, and who went out at his own expense and got the qualification necessary, are refused admission into the Hospital as Civil Surgeon? Have the number of patients gone down? Is the work less this year than last year? Has not the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer inspecting work? When he is away, who is in charge of the Hospital? These are the questions that the Head of the Department is expected to answer. Kindly answer those questions, if you like.

Mr. C. Barton Wright.—Sir, with your permission. I should like to say a few words with reference to the attitude of some of the Hon'ble Members whenever any subject comes up for discussion in connection with the Medical Department.

I am of opinion that we could get through our work much better and quicker if these matters were discussed in a kindlier manner and a more friendly spirit.

Can any one present here to-day say that the Medical Department is not efficiently worked or that our Chief Medical Officer has not done and is not doing all he can to improve the Department and add to the welfare and comfort of the patients?

We are assembled, Sir, in this House with the object of trying to help to advance the interests of this State and its people. We are fortunate in having a kind and sympathetic Government with experienced and able officers, and I am sure that the main object in view of all concerned is to raise and maintain the position and the level of the Cochin State, the leading and most enlightened State of India, and if this object is to be fully achieved, it behoves the non-official Members of this House to join hands and work in unison and harmony with our officials and our Government generally.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Sir, I rise to contribute two words. This is a matter in which we feel. Of course I quite appreciate the Hon'ble Member for Planters' remarks. I must at once tell the House that the very appointment of the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer has not met with the approval of this side of the House.

Mr. Thomas Manjuran.—Order, Sir.

President.—That is beside the point, Mr. Salem.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—It is left to the people of the land whose money is paid to you to have an opinion. It may not carry weight with you, but that is a different matter. I do ask when superannuated gentlemen are appointed in the State, have we nothing to do with the appointment?

President.—Please sit down. We are not discussing about the appointment of the Medical Officer now.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I am sorry I am misunderstood. We were castigated by the Hon'ble Member for Planters for not carrying on a friendly and kindlier spirit. I do say there is justification for a remark of that kind. We speak to the Chair.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—The President has asked the Member to sit down.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I do not know whether you have intended that in that spirit that I should not have a chance of making any remarks. If that is your intention, I shall certainly sit down.

President.—Make your remarks in a dignified way and address the Chair, please.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—We found a particular rule of the Government violated; on the top of that if we find that things are not going on properly in a particular Department, naturally something should be said, and when such things are said, naturally there will be little ascerbities attached to it. That is only natural. It is only to bring out that point that I wanted to say that. It matters very little to me who is appointed. I have not got any pet or favourite of mine, either superannuated or not superannuated, to be appointed in this State. I say that, when we begin to feel that certain kinds of distinctions and differential treatments are being accorded to the subordinates in addition to it, is it not our duty to bring it forward in this Council, and ask the Government to deal with that matter? That is the way in which I will put it. Sir, the burden of charging a Department with having created an appointment for a certain man we can very well understand; and nothing can be said if the claims of those inside the service have been met. What do we find? The Chief Medical Officer created a post and recommended his own son to be an Additional Surgeon in the Hospital, when there has been a ruling already in the Government that no more Civil Surgeons are necessary. He has gone to England for higher studies. We find here in this case applications that came prior to the application of his son to go to England have been kept back, (*hear, hear*) and his application has been given priority. Have we not a right to complain? We complained, with the result that the other gentleman also was sent to England. What followed? There were other persons, equally qualified or with better experience than this gentleman to whom one appointment was created and given, who were not even drafted to fill those acting vacancies. Would you call that kind treatment? Would you call that fair treatment? And then as regards other things, because I am personally affected, it will not be proper for me to say anything, and I do not want to touch upon them. We feel

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

these invidious treatments that have been accorded, and we bring it to your notice. You should take a kindlier view of things because these things are felt so keen. (*Hear, hear.*)

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I began my first speech in this Council by quoting an old saying that no two doctors agree. This House has given monumental proof of the truth of that adage.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—That is only in treatment, Sir; it is not in politics.

Mr. T. K. Krishna Menon.—When doctors disagree, what are we to do?

Dr. A. G. Menon.—You are to die.

Mr. T. K. Krishna Menon.—Splendid idea ! (*Laughter.*)

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Now to deal with the various points raised by the Hon'ble Member for Trichur. It is true that there is a rule that, after three years, those below the rank of Civil Surgeons should be transferred from place to place. It has been made clear in this House and also to the Government that it is an order which under certain circumstances requires exception. Because there are conditions in which a person adapted to a particular work cannot be removed without inconvenience and dislocation of arrangement. So it is not regarded as an absolute rule nor is it laid down in the rule that it should be carried out to the very letter. Can the Hon'ble Member with all his inquiries in the administration of the Medical Department find out one Assistant Surgeon, who has expressed his willingness to come to the General Hospital ? Can he mention one name, who is willing to come to the General Hospital for work? I have issued circulars to ascertain if any one was willing—not one expressed a desire, because of the cost of money here—and the work is hard as compared with independent charge. I will be causing discontentment in the Department, if I remove one man who has cosily settled in one station to the General Hospital? Would it not add to the discontent ? I have asked all the Assistant Surgeons now working outside the General Hospital and I have already mentioned that General Hospital work is not attractive.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—On a point of information. May I know whether the willingness of a party for transfer is considered ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Yes, it is an element for consideration.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—If some Assistant Surgeon gets unpopular in a place, will his willingness or unwillingness be a barrier to transfer him, Sir ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—No. That will be special reason for transferring him. The Hon'ble Member him-

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

self had an experience of the case where from his constituency I have transferred a Surgeon. I knew he was getting unpopular there and I transferred him.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Was Mr. Ittoop under orders of transfer?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—The Legislative Council, Sir, is not the place for discussing these things.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Then which is the place for us to ventilate all these matters except the House before the Government?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—With regard to Civil Surgeons also some reference was made. The medical men mentioned are probably aspirants for Civil Surgeons' place but it would have been really injustice in my opinion to those whom I have now deputed to carry on the work. It would be injustice again to put these hands over the heads of men who possess professional experience and ability which I value very much more than diplomas. A simple European qualification or a diploma in medicine should not alone be taken a factor for consideration. To discuss in this Hall the merits and demerits of subordinate officers like this is rather, I am afraid, derogatory. I can assure the House that I have given real consideration to the question of promoting those who are really qualified, and if there will not be vacancy, it is not my fault. We cannot be directed by a Member of this House. I do not think that there is any other matter requiring my explanation.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Sir, before I withdraw, I should like to add one remark in the matter of transfers. It was stated that the persons are consulted before orders for their transfer are issued. I was under the impression that rules applying to other Departments are applicable to the Medical Department also. I ought to know that better; that it is not so, from my past experience. I am credibly informed that ladies were transferred, some of them, in spite of their protest. What can I say of a Government like this?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—There are reasons.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I know the reasons as well as you do. (*Laughter.*) What can I say of a Government which is going to transfer women out of their places separating them from their husbands and children, and at the same time, because they did not keep the confidence? Under the delicate existing conditions, I shall not proceed to divide this House, but I will enter my emphatic protest against the most unsatisfactory answers given to allegations like these. I withdraw the motions.

(*The motions were, with leave, withdrawn.*)

President.—The question before the House is a sum of Rs. 2,47,176 under 'Demand No. XXI, Medical' be granted,

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Question put and agreed to.

Demand No. XXII.—Vaccination Rs. 8,700.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Sir, I rise to request the House for a grant of Rs. 8,700 under 'Demand No. XXII —Vaccination'.

Motion No. 1.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—*To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 8,700 under 'Demand No. XXII' by Re. 1.*

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Sir, I only tabled this motion for the purpose of knowing the percentage of vaccination and the system of vaccination prevalent.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I do not understand what the Hon'ble Member means.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I want to know whether the vaccinators go to the people's house or the people should come to the Hospital.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—In the towns or in the urban districts?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Whether the vaccinators go to the people or whether the people should come to the Depot? That is the information I want to know.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I have no control in towns.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I am only asking whether the system that you now follow is to have the vaccinator go to the people.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—In districts outside Municipal areas, vaccinators go to the houses and in towns they have to come to the Hospital, or perhaps the vaccinators go to the school where children congregate.

Then with regard to percentage of the unprotected, we never have an exact record of the unprotected. I shall give the successful percentage. 42.09 per thousand.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—This motion was tabled for the purpose of bringing to the notice of the Government that, if you are doing vaccination, 42.09 per thousand is a very bad figure. It cannot be a safety to the people. If you are really vaccinating, vaccinate as much as you possibly can; if not, do away with vaccination, and save the money for the country. We have this year provided some money for the construction of depots in Municipal areas. In Municipal areas it is most easy to vaccinate; for people live in houses in one connected area and we can easily control vaccination. That is the reason why I object to have depots constructed, but I do not stand in the way. The Government might think over it and afterwards do the needful and, therefore, I did not move that cut. I think the system to be

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

adopted is to ask the vaccinators to go to the houses, because otherwise people will not come to the depots for vaccination. It is only to bring these facts to the notice of the Government that I tabled this motion.

(*The motion was, with leave, withdrawn.*)

President.—The question before the House is that a sum of Rs. 8,700 under 'Demand No. XXII—Vaccination' be granted.

Question put and agreed to.

Demand No. XXIII—Sanitation and Conservancy—Rs. 44,800.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Sir, I rise to request for a grant of Rs. 44,800 under the head 'Sanitation and Conservancy.'

Motion No. 1.

A. State General.

Mr. C. J. Mathew.— *To reduce the allotment of Rs. 17,750 for 'Sanitation works proper' by Rs. 10.*

President.—Motion No. 1, Mr. C. J. Mathew.

Mr. C. J. Mathew.—I wish to point out by this motion that it would be desirable to separate the Sanitary Department from Medicine, with a view to improve the present sanitary conditions of our village parts because, as it is, our rural parts are sadly neglected. If you happen to go through some of the villages of my constituency, you will be struck by their filthy atmosphere. In the reply speech made by the Chief Medical Officer he has given us an assuarance,.....

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—No assurance.

Mr. C. J. Mathew.—At least some undertaking that he will seriously consider this question and keep this Department under a separate Health Officer. In that case, I don't press the cut.

(*The motion was with drawn with leave.*)

Motion No. 2.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—*To reduce the allotment of Rs. 17,750 for 'Sanitation Works (Municipal Council)' by Re. 1.*

President.—Cut motion No. 2.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I have tabled this motion for the purpose of drawing the attention of the Government that, in spite of the great demand by the Mattancheri Municipality and the people thereof for a hospital, no provision has been made in the budget of 1104.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—This is Sanitary Department.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Doesn't matter.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Is it in order, Sir?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly